

TV News and Immigration Issues with Regards Access to the Public Agenda

Josep Gifreu, Joan Maria Corbella, Laia Aubia and Roberto Suárez

- *The purpose of this article is to examine how the main Spanish television stations intervene in the processes of selecting and narrating immigration-related conflicts through the TV news. It also aims to offer a specific methodology for the monitoring and analysis of television information on the issue of immigration and to facilitate the continuation of comparative studies between stations and over time. The article summarises the results obtained from a qualitative analysis of a sample of three periods in 2003 when we compared the agendas of the general-interest Spanish stations TVE-1, Antena 3 TV and Tele-5 and the Catalan station TV3. The results made it possible to detect important insufficiencies in the television coverage of immigration problems, as well as noticeable differences in the activity of each station as a selector and narrator of conflicts relating to the new migration flows to Spain.*

Key words

Television, immigration, thematic agenda, TV news, Spain, Catalonia, agenda setting.

Josep Gifreu, Joan Maria Corbella, Laia Aubia and Roberto Suárez

Members of the UNICA/UPF Group

1. Objectives

The reception of immigrants from around the world in Spain is, as has been said before, a relatively new phenomenon. It is new from the socioeconomic viewpoint and also from the political one. In recent years, the constant flow of new emigrants crossing the Spanish borders has begun to be one of the main objects of public and police attention.

Indeed, the immigrants reach the borders and are immediately identified, detained, registered and possibly returned to their home country by the border police. This repeated image in the now-commonplace iconography of European Union border countries sums up the crucial role of the guard in an immigrant's access to the position of new citizen.

The purpose of this article is, similarly, to explore the role of guard that the media, and most particularly TV news shows, are awarded in the creation of public images and agendas on the processes and conflicts of immigration. In this regard, the article sets out some of the results of a broader research project entitled "Television and the Construction of a Public Image of Immigration in Spain"¹, funded as part of the 2001-2003 National Knowledge Plan.

The international research tradition in journalism and communication has interpreted and explained these processes of media intervention in the control of information and the public agenda as processes of gate keeping, agenda setting and news-worthiness.

In this framework, the basic goal of the article is to contribute a number of preliminary, exploratory approximations on how the main Spanish television stations intervene in the processes of selecting or marginalizing immigration-related conflicts through TV news shows. It also aims to prepare and justify a specific methodology for the monitoring and analysis of television information on the issue of immigration with the purpose of facilitating the continuation

of comparative studies between stations and over time. The methodology applied in this research work has been used with more or less significant variations in different studies by the UNICA Group from the Pompeu Fabra University on the thematic agendas in TV news shows.²

2. Methodology Notes

2.1. Theoretical Framework

This study is located at the crossroads between two of the main current lines of research about the role of the media and its mediations in the definition of public problems. On one hand, the sociology of knowledge proposes considering the media as narrative and discursive instruments central to the social construction of reality. In this area, the study of news and the role of journalists and news companies in the processes of selection and classification and the building of hierarchies about events of public interest in order to attribute them public relevance has a solid tradition of reference studies.³

On the other hand, a strong research orientation proceeding from political theory, and more particularly political communication, considers the media as fundamental intermediaries in the construction of public problems. In other words, fundamental in the determination of reference images of social unrest, which compete between political actors and appeal to the intervention of political power. In this regard, we are particularly interested in a number of lines of thought that propose researching how social problems become public problems, which actors are more likely to successfully compete and which types of involvement between the media and political systems are involved in the processes of defining particular problems as public ones⁴.

In this theoretical context, we can presuppose that the definition by the media of a thematic agenda and the definition of a particular field of social unrest as a public problem are intimately linked.

The research tradition of an empirical basis that belongs to the agenda-setting school has set out part of both orientations. The theoretical and methodological framework of agenda-setting, particularly on the basis of the innovative contributions of Iyengar and Kinder and the founder himself,

McCombs⁵, as well as the new perspectives introduced by framing methodologies, make it possible to establish the methodological bases of this work.

2.2. Study Object

The empirical object of the study project was the news shows on the general-interest television stations in Spain during 2003. Given the volume of the universe to examine, a sampling strategy was imposed which was broadly significant of the whole and which enabled economic management of the sample and the application of analysis protocols.

The particular study object was a sample of primetime news shows from the three State general-interest stations, i.e., TVE-1, Tele-5 and Antena 3 TV, and the Catalan general-interest station TV3.

The total of the news shows analysed covered six weeks in 2003, distributed over three periods of two weeks each, corresponding to the months of February, July and September, as indicated in the table 1:

The selection of these three periods responded to the adopted qualitative research strategy (following the recommendations of authors like Altheide and Casseti and De Chio⁶): a first period chosen at random (July) and then completion of the sample with two significant periods (February and September) in line with the monitoring of the journalistic information published in a selection of the written press between November 2002 and September 2003.

Following the press agenda made it possible to determine significant periods on the basis of contextual criteria that could influence the probabilities of access to the news shows of immigration-related information. Thus, the periods analysed were periods that were not, in terms of news, greatly conditioned by unusual political or journalistic factors (mainly the war in Iraq and the municipal and autonomous-community electoral campaigns and the autonomous-community campaign in Catalonia), which might have altered the results.

2.3. Research Strategy

The research strategy applied to this objective followed the steps described below:

1. Preparation of the repertoire of key words. To facilitate content classification of the units and subsequent

Table 1. Television News Samples from the Stations Analysed

Station	Period	Month	Year	Number of News Shows	Time *	Station total
TVE-1	Days 1-14	February	2003	14	10h 36'05"	30h 15'32"
	Days 30-13	June/ July	2003	13	10h 44'39"	
	Days 6-19	September	2003	14	8h 54'48"	
Antena 3 TV	Days 1-14	February	2003	14	9h 12'35"	25h 47'48"
	Days 30-13	June/ July	2003	13	9h 47'04"	
	Days 6-19	September	2003	13	6h 54'09"	
Tele-5	Days 1-14	February	2003	14	9h 52'45"	29h 54'39"
	Days 30-13	June/ July	2003	13	9h 46'58"	
	Days 6-19	September	2003	13	10h 14'56"	
TV3	Days 1-14	February	2003	14	10h 49'03"	32h 08' 07"
	Days 30-13	June/ July	2003	13	10h 30'27"	
	Days 6-19	September	2003	13	10h 48'37"	
Total time analysed						118h 06'06"

* The time of each news show includes advertising breaks in the middle

analysis, a list of key words⁷ was drawn up with regards the problematization of immigration on television. To make this catalogue of key words, the need to include all the descriptors that appeared in the selected time samples was taken into account, along with the criterion of not making a universal catalogue about the study topic. We monitored the press (key to the sample selection) as a basis for a preparing a wide range of descriptors that made it possible to exhaustively identify the sub-issue, types of characters, actions and reference territories that predominated when it came to preparing the news proposals. The particular fields established to classify the units, and within which many key words were grouped, were: "Sociogeographic Space", i.e., the sociogeographic reference in relation to the place of the events or actions or with the place the protagonists came from; "Social Agents", which classified the protagonists of the actions according to whether they were public authorities, social institutions, individuals, etc.; and the fundamental "Themes/Actions" the analysis unit referred to, which included a double level (issue and sub-issue) to optimise unit identification.

2. Design of an analysis matrix. This was designed to apply to all the information units related with the study object.⁸ The matrix not only made it possible to identify, define and describe the presence of the issue on the news agenda of each station, but it could also be evaluated in terms of position on the news rundown and presence and importance on the summary. The matrix also considered the study of the journalistic genres used, the identification and evaluation of the sources of information, both with regards news and images, the definition of the main characters that appeared and many other elements that contributed to drawing the narrative strategies of each station when it came to constructing the public image of immigration. The quantification of the news units and items involved made it possible to establish comparisons between different stations, both with regards number of units over the whole and time devoted, as well as the corresponding specifications related to the importance, issue, main character and identification of the sources of each of the units and of the stations as a whole.

3. Contextualisation of the news selection. The analysis

and evaluation of the empirical selection of the sample took into account both the external context of the news and the internal context within the station and its programming policies. The first factor made it necessary to consider the news context of the weeks analysed in order to detect the presence of major events and issues that captured the attention of all the news media, and therefore also television, and limited attention to problems considered of lesser importance (which the case of immigration may be, for example). In this sense, the war in Iraq, floods and major sporting events are three examples of big issues that 'contaminated' all the news information during the selected sample period. The second factor to bear in mind referred to the programming analysis of each station and the programming availability that each station had to meet its news function. In this sense, the presence of the issue which was the study object in the news could not be considered in isolation, but had to be framed within the whole of the station's programming. The assessment of the access of the issue of immigration to the stations' news agendas had to bear in mind the fact that some stations only have news shows to meet their news function, while others (public stations mainly) include other reports and documentary spaces where news and current-affairs content can be expanded on.

4. Comparison with the press agenda. The methodology applied to the analysis of the television samples involved, as I have said, comparing the television agenda with the one detected in the overall set of reference newspapers⁹. This made it possible to relate the thematic selection that appeared on TV with what the daily papers did on the same dates. It was based on the consideration that TV news shows include a smaller number of thematic units than newspapers and that the latter have a much greater facility for shaping coverage space than TV news shows do, so the press can be followed to obtain a fairly exhaustive list of events and news stories that TV shows could choose in the same period. Consequently, a comparison between the press news list and the list of issues included on the television news shows has significant elements for assessing the selection made by the different stations and knowing the proportion of immigration-related news items that were

excluded from the attention of the TV news show. This exercise was therefore aimed at trying to complete and explain the selection processes the matrix identified.

3. Results

3.1. The Presence of Immigration

The first thing to mention from the analysis of the three samples examined is the scarce number of news units dedicated to the issue of immigration during the periods analysed. This means the results obtained must be considered with caution and in any case be taken as a basis of comparison for future research work.

From the four stations analysed, the most unusual feature is the figure recorded by TVE-1, which devoted only eight units (half or less than the other stations analysed) to immigration-related topics. Tele-5 and TV3 were the two stations with the greatest number of units collected (18) and Antena 3 TV was halfway, with 14 news items. Consequently, the time devoted to immigration by the news shows of the four stations analysed in the sample periods chosen was very small with respect to the total sample time: immigration represented the object of a news story in 0.57% of the news time at TVE-1, 1.24% in the case of Antena 3 TV, 1.44% in the case of the Catalan station, and 1.86% in the case of Tele-5, which devoted a relatively more important space to the study object.

In terms of the distribution of the news units considered, there was a homogenous tendency among the four stations. Although the number of units differed, the proportions were similar in all cases. As we can see in Table 2, the sample period when all the stations recorded a relatively lower time than the total news time was the first half of February, when the number of collected units was lowest. The other two periods, i.e., the months of July and September, included the same number of units if we consider the stations separately and practically the same for all the stations (around 7 units) except TVE-1 (around four units). It is interesting to note that the amounts did not correspond with expectations when selecting the sample, based on press monitoring of the months of February and September and on chance or intuition in the month of July. As I will show further on, in the analysis of the news time discriminated by television and

Table 2. Units and Time Devoted to Immigration on the TV News Shows of TVE-1, Antena 3 TV, Tele-5 and TV3

Station	Period	Units	Time	Relative
TVE-1	February 2003 (01-14)	1	1'40"	0.26 %
	June-July 2003 (30-13)	4	5'15"	0.81 %
	September 2003 (06-19)	3	3'26"	0.64 %
	Total	8	10'21"	0.57 %
Antena 3 TV	February 2003 (01-14)	0	0	-
	June-July 2003 (30-13)	7	11'32"	1.96 %
	September 2003 (06-19)	7	7'45"	1.87 %
	Total	14	19'17"	1.24 %
Tele-5	February 2003 (01-14)	4	9'49"	1.66 %
	June-July 2003 (30-13)	7	12'57"	2.21 %
	September 2003 (06-19)	7	10'37"	1.73 %
	Total	18	33'23"	1.86 %
TV3	February 2003 (01-14)	5	6'22"	0.98 %
	June-July 2003 (30-13)	6	8'24"	1.33 %
	September 2003 (06-19)	7	13'03"	2.01 %
	Total	18	27'49"	1.44 %

included in the press, in February there were a number of stories picked up by the press which one would think would have been transferred to the TV news, but which were not.

3. 2. Arranging Immigration Issues In Order of Importance

Despite the scarcity of units devoted to immigration, the decision to include or exclude them from the summary constituted a clear intervention in the hierarchical structuring and therefore the process of prioritising the public image of social unrest derived from migration flows.

The four stations analysed featured approximately a quarter of the units devoted to immigration-related issues (between three and four units in overall figures) in the summaries of their respective news shows. The two stations with the lowest number of units, Antena 3 TV and TVE-1, had three on the summary, but in both cases, two were lead stories. On the other hand, TV3 and Tele-5, with a higher total number of stories devoted to the study object,

had four on the summary, but led with very few only one in the case of TV3).

With regard to the level of inclusion of the news units referring to the various issues of immigration on the summaries or news shows of the diverse stations analysed, I would like to mention the following: Of the 11 stories relating to studies and statistical figures referring to immigration as a major social phenomenon, almost half (four) appeared on the summaries of the different stations, most (three) during the third fortnight analysed which, as I said before, included the start of the school year and provided the stations with lots of figures. Of the ten units referring to legislative bills, more than half appeared on the summary. Of these, four were produced during the third sample period, when the reform of the Immigration Law was approved, a story that featured on all the news agendas. The only two stations that included this when it was still in the discussion phase, and which even included it on the summary, were the two public stations, the Catalan and Spanish ones, during July 2003 (second sample period). In

terms of school enrolments, the third biggest topic all the stations had in common, it was completely linked to statistical figures. Of the six units referring to education, two-thirds were included on the summary and featured at the start of the school year. It is important to mention here that only two units of the total did anything more than show figures to refer to the integration of immigrant children in the classrooms. These two units were broadcast by the two private stations analysed and only in the case of Tele-5 was the story included on the summary.

In terms of three of the issues associated with the news agenda on immigration during those months, i.e., social unrest, 'pateras' (small fishing boats often used in illegal immigration) and the living conditions of immigrants, their presence on the summaries was practically irrelevant. Of the stories referring to attacks and assaults, only one-quarter appeared on a summary. In terms of pateras, none of the five units collected with this key word appeared on the summaries. Only TV3 and Tele-5 referred to this issue on a few occasions spread over the three sample periods, and neither awarded it particular importance. With regards the news stories recorded with the key word 'beating', not only was there a minimum presence (two units), but in no case was it on the station summaries. In relation to living conditions of the immigrant collective, it was not often found in the analysed survey, but it should be said that only once was it on the summary and that was on the Catalan station, the one with the most units devoted to questions referring to immigrants' lifestyles, traditions and customs.

Finally, the distribution of the news units in one position or another during the course of the news show was another criterion of forming a news hierarchy. In this regard, there was a marked difference between TVE-1 and Antena 3 TV on the one hand, and TV3 and Tele-5 on the other. The first two took the general line observed and put half their news stories in the first third and the other half in the second. TV3 and Tele-5 distributed their stories over the length of the news shows, reserving most for the second-third (practically half the news units) and the other half between the first and the third. As well as this similarity, they were the two stations with the greatest volume of information broadcast about immigration, and the ones that paid attention, to a greater or lesser degree depending on the case concerned, to background issues to the phenomenon (lifestyles, traditions, integration, etc.).

3.3. Repertoire of Sources and Treatment of Stories

The identification of sources (both in terms of news and the specific case of images) warrants special theoretical and empirical attention in a research work that focuses on the media's contribution to the construction and definition of public problems. Using the theory of 'event-driven problems' (Lawrence, 2000) we prepared a typology that made it possible to define the type of source that the news stories analysed were based on and subsequently the type of conflict that was the object of attention on the basis of the level of anticipation. I would like to distinguish between two models of journalistic construction: the 'institutionally driven' model (i.e., the official model, where information comes from official and institutional sources characterised by a higher level of anticipation) and the 'event-driven' model (i.e., accidental and unexpected events where journalists are forced to seek and interrogate the sources of information from among the people involved in the events). The origin of the images is also obviously of interest for analysis purposes. Often the availability of images about an event is what determines whether it will be included on the summary or news show and in which position.

Firstly, news relating to immigration collected by the stations during the period analysed presented a fairly balanced distribution in terms of anticipation and most could be anticipated (nearly 40% of cases). Anticipated and non-anticipated events had a practically symmetric level. If we look more closely at each of the stations analysed, we see that Tele-5 was the one most likely to feature events that could be anticipated in its information, and Antena 3 TV the one with most stories that were not anticipated. The case of TVE-1 was the most balanced (bearing in mind the few units analysed by the station) and TV3 stood out for the low number of non-anticipated units included. This is contradicted by the institutional presence in the journalistic coverage which, in all cases and particularly that of Tele-5, was minimal.

Secondly, if we analyse the type of news sources used, we see that official sources (including parliamentary, governmental, judicial and police sources) were used in 65% of the units, while the remaining 35% used non-official sources (protagonists, civil organisations, family members, neighbours, other media, etc.). While the official sources were

explicitly mentioned in nearly 82% of the cases, the same did not happen when non-official sources were used, when they were usually not named. The exception was the Catalan station, the only one to invert the proportions and mention non-official sources in 5 out of the 7 total cases.

On the other hand, with regards the visual content of the news units, in nearly all the cases the images used came from either the newsroom or a reporter or correspondent. The proportion for these two options, however, was different at each station. While Antena 3 TV and TV3 presented a balance between the two, at Tele-5 and TVE-1 we can see inverse tendencies: TVE-1 very rarely opted for the reporter or correspondent and Tele-5 almost never used footage from the newsroom. Some stations also opted sometimes for news archives (e.g., TV3) and sporadically, agencies (Tele-5 and Antena 3 TV), the police (one unit on Antena 3 TV, Tele-5 and TV3) or an amateur source (once only in the case of Tele-5). In all cases, the assessment of access to sources was practically always neutral (there were two cases where it could be defined as positive).

Finally, and in the context of this section, it is worth mentioning some of the data relating to the use of particular journalists to introduce and lead the unit. Although we can see small differences in each case, the stations analysed fundamentally used the presenter and off-screen reporter in the journalistic introduction of the units related to the study object issues (in 90% and 72% of cases, respectively). The use of the off-screen presenter was also important in the cases of TV3 and Antena 3 TV, although less than with the two previous options. The practically complete absence of correspondents for the units devoted to immigration reveals the isolated nature of this type of information.

3.4. Immigration-Related Topics

The three big topics associated with immigration identified in the studied sample were immigration policies (including legislative bills, expulsions and legalisations and permit procedures), immigration as a social phenomenon (due to the high frequency of stories related to statistics and studies) and education (through school-enrolment figures and stories about integration in classrooms). The results at this level were conditioned by the incidence of three of the big events that took place during the two sample periods with the highest figure of units related to the study object issue:

the presentation of the *Anuario de Inmigración en España* (*Yearbook of Immigration in Spain*) of July 2003, the reform of the Immigration Law and the start of the school year in September that year. Indeed, if we look at the partial results referring to the third sample period, which includes the start of the school year and the time when the legislative reform was approved, we see that the level of agreement between the different stations analysed when it came to drawing up their news agendas was much higher than in the two previous periods.

If we take a detailed look at the three big categories that group together all the list of key words we drew up¹⁰, the results can be broken down more fully. Firstly, a recount of the presence of issues grouped under the category “Themes/Actions” allows us to establish the activities or types of events that most frequently framed the immigration phenomenon. Secondly, counting the presence of words in the category “Social Agents” allows us to look more closely at the parties involved in the framework of action in question. Finally, the “Sociogeographic Reference” of the content unit completes the issue thematic classification of the news agendas and positions the events and/or protagonists in a particular space.

Although the news agenda about immigration in the different stations analysed included diverse themes and hierarchies, the analysis of the selected news units enabled us to show the presence of thematic categories that can be added to the three big ones mentioned (immigration policies/legislation, immigration as a social phenomenon and education). Using summaries of the units collected and above all through listing key terms about the presence of the issue of the problematization of immigration grouped under the categories “Themes/Actions”, we can see, in order of most to least volume, the presence of stories related to: statistics about the presence of immigrants in Spain; the political debate about the Immigration Law; the impact of immigration on compulsory education figures (only on the dates in September when the study was done); movements across the borders and around Spain; and some diverse facts associated with crime with some point of notoriety in terms of news treatment, e.g., the breaking up of bands of foreigners, contraband, fraudulent marriages, etc. (it is important to say that nationality was used in these television stories rather than the condition of an immigrant person).

With regard to “Social Agents”, the list of terms with the most appearances was headed by immigration as a collective (to be developed further on), police (secondly) and the Spanish government. There were also numerous appearances of immigrant minors, criminals, organised groups or mafias and immigrants as individuals. The “Sociogeographic Reference” of the content units was predominantly Spanish and Catalan and also the local and municipal sphere.

In terms of the territorial identification of the theme or protagonists, only 17 units from the total sample (19 occasions) identified non-Spanish origins. Of these references, only four corresponded to the stations involved in this article: two by Tele-5 and one each by TV3 and Antena 3 TV. The two mentions by Tele-5 and that of Antena 3 TV identified the issue of the protagonist as a sub-Saharan African. In the case of TV3, the territorial reference was Asian.

3.5. The Main Characters

The study of the character that received most coverage in the unit was done on the basis of a typology that differentiated between individuals (classifying them according to sex, age and national condition), groups (social, NGOs or other types) and institutions (including politicians and the parliaments of various geopolitical spheres, the judicial power, trade unions, the ecclesiastical hierarchy, business and finance activity, scientific and technical activity, intellectual and artistic activity, journalism and social communication, crime, terrorism, sport and entertainment). The stations analysed tended to identify the main character in their news stories as a group (in 63.8% of the cases), while institutional characters and individuals (with a presence of 20.7% and 15.5% respectively) were in very equal second and third positions. The station that demonstrated this trend the most was TV3, where its news shows, at least in the period analysed, did not present any character as an individual and very few as an institution (4 out of 18, i.e., 22.2%). The station that included the greatest number of units or stories featuring a character presented as an individual was Antena 3 TV. The news shows of this station were also the ones that presented the most balance in the distribution of the three categories. Although Tele-5 and TVE-1 followed a similar line, TVE-1 was more similar to Antena 3 TV in terms of the weight awarded individual

characters, while Tele-5 was similar to TV3 in terms of the presence of groups.

Bearing in mind that immigration was mainly shown as a group, it is interesting to look more closely at the categories made and to analyse what types of groups had the most presence. At this level, the results were more homogenous. Tele-5, TVE-1 and Antena 3 TV showed all the groups as social ones. Only TV3 presented four units of the 14 in which the group was of a different type, particularly an NGO (two units). In terms of institutional characters, broadly speaking half the cases involved a Spanish government policy, followed by 15% with a policy by the autonomous community. The rest was distributed between autonomous community parliaments, European Union policies, foreign policies, trade unionism and others.

3.6. The Stations as Selectors and Narrators

The study of the immigration agenda at each station shows a number of differences worth pointing out in their functions of selectors and narrators. The two public stations (TVE-1 and TV3) approached social unrest mainly in terms of public policies on immigration and as a social phenomenon. TV3, however, was different from the State station in terms of the volume of time devoted to immigration-related stories and the large diversity of units dedicated to issues relating to cultures and lifestyles of immigrant communities, difficulties in getting job contracts and condemnations by organisations such as SOS Racismo and Amnesty International. On the other hand, the two private Spanish stations included a higher number of cases related to police actions, crime and attacks and assaults, with a particular emphasis at Tele-5 on units related to immigrant movements and the development of stories relating to public policies in the case of Antena 3 TV.

On the other hand, the analysis of the volume of immigration-related information and issues on each station has to take into consideration a number of contextual factors that allow an assessment that better adjusts to the stations' role in the construction of the public image about immigration. The general framework of the programming, the context of the major issues on the media agenda and the news environment collected by the press offer some significant elements in this regard.

Firstly, and as stated in the programming studies included

in this issue of *Quaderns*, the two public stations analysed, TVE-1 and TV3, had complementary news spaces in their programming, where they could more exhaustively develop some of the issues raised in the news or complete the range of their news agenda through the use of reports. The two private stations, Antena 3 TV and Tele-5, on the other hand, had to situate all their news proposals on their news shows because of a lack of complementary programmes. This might help explain the differences detected in the way of covering stories and their very selection.

Secondly, in a similar fashion in all the stations, the existence of other big current affairs issues impeded the presence of information relating to the topic at hand. So, while the run-up to the war in Iraq featured heavily in the news shows during the month of February and contributed to the scarcity of stories about immigration, July and September featured a higher volume of units because of the force of stories on the topic imposed by others: in particular, the agreement between the PP and the PSOE on a new Immigration Law and the start of the school year in which the presence of immigrant children became one of the key news element in all the media.

Thirdly, the differences between television and press in the coverage and treatment of immigration over the three periods examined is very significant. Indeed, it is important to highlight some stories that the press mentioned but which had zero or very little presence in the conventional news shows of the television stations. During the sample period in February, competing with other major issues (Iraq), the news shows did not feature political proposals such an idea from the Home Office about programmes for the voluntary return of immigrants, or the Generalitat of Catalonia's idea to subsidise private schools to take in immigrant children. Although these stories featured in all the leading Spanish newspapers, the statements by Ana Botella, wife of the president of the Spanish Government, José María Aznar, in which she associated public insecurity with illegal immigration, were not included in any of the news bulletins of the stations analysed. In the July sample, information about the debate on the state of the nation in the Spanish Parliament did not include any speech about immigration policies, or the result of a poll which found that 58% of Spaniards linked insecurity with immigration. In the specific framework of Catalonia, there was a remarkable absence

on TV3's news agenda of three issues that all the Catalan papers featured at the time: the criticism and denunciations about sending immigrants without papers to Lleida which was ordered by the Spanish Government; the consequences for immigrants of the evictions and demolishing of houses in Sant Andreu and the statements by Artur Mas and Jordi Pujol in relation to the need to learn Catalan as a requisite for becoming legalised¹¹. Along the same line, during the sample period in September, there was nothing on any of the stations analysed (not even the Catalan one) about the story that appeared in all the papers with regards the Catalan Government's announcement to establish an official act of adhesion of immigrants to obtain the recognition.

4. Conclusions

Among the most significant aspects of the exploratory study about the construction of the television agenda on immigration in Spain, employed in 2003 on the basis of three samples of news shows from the Spanish stations TVE-1, Antena 3 TV and Tele-5 and the Catalan autonomous station TV3, we would like to highlight the following points:

Firstly, with regard to the coverage of the issue of immigration, it was surprising how few news units there were on the four stations dedicated to this issue. In the three samples considered, which totalled six weeks, the relative time devoted to the issue was 1.86% (of the total news shown) at Tele-5, 1.44% at TV3, 1.24% at Antena 3 TV and 0.57% at TVE-1. The case of TVE-1, the Spanish public station, is particularly eloquent in showing the lack of interest in the coverage of a problem that is progressively present in public life.

Secondly, if we list the sources and treatment of the stories, we see that more than two-thirds of the news units (65%) came from official sources. Although approximately half the stories about immigration arose from non-anticipated or non-scheduled events, the great dependence of the information on this point with respect to official sources suggests a low diligence or clear inhibition on the part of the stations in taking the new circumstances of immigration into consideration as a central issue of public life.

Thirdly, and despite the previous appreciation, television

does not completely ignore the new phenomenon that is upsetting Spanish society. Characters and issues with regards immigration are beginning to flourish on the surface of the agenda. Indeed, the four stations analysed tended to identify the main immigration character (in 64% of cases) as a group of immigrants rather than institutional (20%) or individual characters (15%). With regards the main issues associated with immigration, the samples identified three of the most important: legislative and immigration policies (particularly news about the Immigration Act), high figures and immigration as a social phenomenon (materialised in the presentation of a report on the state of immigration) and immigration in relation to education (particularly with the start of the school year).

Fourthly, the singular condition of each station as a selector and narrator of immigration issues can also be seen at many levels. There was a consistent differentiation between public and private in the predisposition to particular approaches to immigrant conflicts. The public stations (TVE-1 and TV3) approached social unrest in terms of public policies that should apply to immigration as a new social phenomenon. The private stations (Tele-5 and Antena 3 TV) tended to emphasise the aspect of the conflict most susceptible to dramatisation and sensationalism, such as police actions, crime, assaults, movements, etc.

Finally, the comparison of the thematic agenda about immigration during the three sample periods between the four television stations and the written press with a similar overall coverage or dissemination raised questions about the level of reduction of the television agenda. The question is not so much whether the press overall handles and deals with immigration issues with more breadth and depth, because it obviously does. The question this study raises is the point to which the stations analysed, both public and private, devoted the attention and consideration that the problems of the new immigration required in 2003, and which the press largely detected. There are issues and debates of importance that did not make it onto the TV agenda. The provisional conclusion that this suggests is that, in general, major television stations were not diligent enough during 2003 in their news coverage and in the definition of a sufficiently representative agenda of the new problems and challenges of immigration.

Notes

- 1 The project “La televisión y la construcción de una imagen pública de la inmigración en España” was awarded a PGC-MCYT grant from the Spanish Ministry for Science and Technology in the 2001 official announcement and was led by the consolidated UNICA group from Pompeu Fabra University, under the leadership, as the principal researcher, of Dr. Josep Gifreu. The following researchers also collaborated in some phase of the project: Agustín García Mantilla (Complutense University of Madrid), María Ángeles González Abrisketa and Rosa María Martín Sabarís (University of the Basque Country), Aurora Labio Bernal (University of Seville), Rosanna Mestre (University of Valencia) and Francisco Javier Vaz (University of Santiago de Compostela). The project also enjoyed the active collaboration of the Technical Services Department of the Catalonia Broadcasting Council to obtain copies of the television samples of the four stations analysed.
- 2 See the summary of applications in the presentation of Annex1.
- 3 See the examples of ALTHEIDE (1976), TUCHMAN (1978), GANS (1979), GITLIN (1980), GRABER (1980), BENNET (1983).
- 4 See EDELMAN, M. (1971, 1988); GUSFIELD, J. (1981); KINGDON, J. W. (1984); PALETZ, D. L. (1987); BEST, J. (1988); ERICSON, R. V., BARANEK, P. M., I CHAN, J. B. L. (1989).
- 5 Particularly see IYENGAR, Sh. and KINDER, D. R. (1987); IYENGAR, Sh. (1991); MCCOMBS, M., SHAW, D. L. and WEAVER, D. (1997).
- 6 ALTHEIDE (1996) and CASSETTI and DI CHIO (1999)
- 7 See Annex 1
- 8 See Annex 2
- 9 The newspapers monitored in the period between November 2002 and September 2003 were: *ABC*, *El Mundo*, *El País*, *La Razón* i *La Vanguardia* (Spain-wide); *El Periódico de Catalunya*, *Avui*, *Regió 7*, *Diari de Tarragona* and *Diari de Terrassa* (Catalonia-wide); *Diario de Burgos* and *Diario de Navarra* (regional Spanish sphere), *Expansión*, *Expansión Cataluña*, *Cinco Días* (economics); and *Le Figaro* and *Le Monde Diplomatique* (international sphere).
- 10 See Annex 2 for the distribution of the topics into three categories (“Themes/Actions”, “Social Agents” and “Sociogeographic Reference”) and see section 2.3. on research strategies for a more detailed development of the list.
- 11 According to the CAC report entitled “Informacions sobre immigració aparegudes en els teletinformatius d'àmbit català durant els anys 2002, 2003 i 2004” (*News Stories about Immigration Grouped Together in the Catalonia-Wide Television News Shows During the Years 2002, 2003 and 2004*), TV3 included information about the immigrants in Alcarràs beginning 15 July 2003, two days after the finalisation date of our July sample. In terms of news relating to the Sant Andreu district, it is important to mention that although the CAC said TV3 reported the start of the campaign to get rid of rats and knock down buildings on 3, 9 and 10 July, our analysis does not include them in the sample because they did not specifically deal with the relation of these events with immigration, the object of our study.
The CAC publication, which was not taken into account when the report was drawn up because it was dated 13 April 2005, analysed the presence of information about immigration in the lunchtime and evening news shows of the Spanish stations (TVE-1, Tele-5 and Antena 3 TV), the Catalan stations (TV3 and K3/33) and the local broadcasters Barcelona BTV and Citytv.

Bibliography

- ALTHEIDE, D. L. *Creating Reality: How TV News Distorts Events*. Beverly Hills (California): Sage, 1976.
- ALTHEIDE, D. L. *Quantitative Media Analysis*. Thousand Oaks (California): Sage, 1996.
- BENNET, W. L. *News: The Politics of Illusion*. London, New York: Longman, 1983.
- BEST, J. *Images of Issues: Typifying Contemporary Social Problems*. New York: Aldine de Gruyter, 1988.
- CASETTI, F.; DI CHIO, F. *Análisis de la televisión: instrumentos, métodos y prácticas de investigación*. Barcelona: Paidós, 1999.
- EDELMAN, M. *Politics as Symbolic Action*. New York: Academic Press, 1971,
- EDELMAN, M. *Constructing the Political Spectacle*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988
- ENTMAN, R. "Framing Toward Clarification of a Fractured Paradigm", *Journal of Communication*, 43-4, 1993, pp 51-58.
- ERICSON, R. V.; BARANEK, P. M. ; CHAN, J. B. L. *Negotiating Control: A Study of News Sources*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1989.
- GANS, H. J. *Deciding What's News*. New York: Pantheon, 1979.
- GIFREU, J.; PALLARÈS, F. (EDS). *Comunicació política i comportament electoral a les eleccions autonòmiques de 1995 a Catalunya*. Barcelona: Mediterrània, 1998.
- GIFREU, J.; PALLARÈS, F. (EDS.). *La campanya més disputada: Mitjans, partits i ciutadans a les eleccions catalanes del 1999*. Barcelona: Pòrtic, 2001.
- GITLIN, T. *The Whole World is Watching*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980.
- GOFFMAN, E., *Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience*. Boston, Northeastern University Press, 1974
- GRABER, D. *Crime News and the Public*. New York: Praeger, 1980.
- GUSFIELD, J. *The Culture of Public Problems*. Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1981
- IYENGAR, SH.; KINDER, D. R. *News that Matters: Television and American Opinion*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1987.
- IYENGAR, SH. *Is Anyone Responsible? How Television Frames Political Issues*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1991.
- KINGDON, J. W. *Agendas, Alternatives, and Public Policies*. New York, Harper Collins, 1984.
- LAWRENCE, R.G. *The Politics of Force. Media and the Construction of Police Brutality*, Berkeley (LA)-London, University of California Press, 2000.
- MCCOMBS, M.; SHAW, D. L.; WEAVER, D. (EDS.). *Communication and Democracy: Exploring the Intellectual Frontiers in Agenda-Setting*. Mahwah (N.J.): Lawrence Erlbaum, 1997.
- PALETZ, D. L. (ED.). *Political Communication Research: Approaches, Studies, Assessments*. Norwood (N.J.): Ablex, 1987.
- REESE, S. D.; GANDY, O. H.; GRANT, A. E. (EDS.). *Framing Public Life*. Mahwah (NJ)-London, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2001.
- TUCHMAN, G. *Making News: A Study in the Construction of Reality*. New York: Free Press, 1978

Annexes

ANNEX 1

MATRIX FOR ANALYSING IMMIGRATION IN THE TELEVISION NEWS SHOWS OF SPAIN

Josep Gifreu i Joan M. Corbella

Presentation

This analysis matrix of television news shows, conceived specifically to apply to the research project entitled “La televisió i la construcció d’una imatge pública de la immigració a Espanya” (*Television and the Construction of a Public Image of Immigration in Spain*) is a new version of the basic matrix developed over the years by the UNICA group at Pompeu Fabra University to study the agenda of the television news shows. One of the applications of the basic matrix is the preparation of diverse competitive projects and research contracts and in particular three studies into the political agenda in the electoral campaigns for the Parliament of Catalonia (elections of 1995, 1999 and 2003), two works on the image of Catalonia (1999) and the identity of Spain on the news shows of the Spanish stations (2001), one work about the format and agenda of news shows in Spain (1996) and a comparative study about European news shows and the transformation of national public spaces (1994).

1. IDENTIFICATION OF KEY WORDS

2. IDENTIFICATION OF ANALYSIS UNITS

2.0. UNIT NUMBER

2.1. IDENTIFICATION OF TELEVISION STATION

2.1.1. Television news (TN):

2.1.1.1. Midday/afternoon

2.1.1.2. Afternoon/night

2.1.1.3. Station:

Antena 3 TV

Tele-5

TVE-1

TV3-K3/33

2.1.2. Date (day/month/year)

2.1.3. Day of the week

2.1.4. Broadcast time

2.1.5. Incidences

2.1.6. Duration, position and order on the news show

2.1.6.1. Duration

2.1.6.2. Summary (yes) (no)

2.1.6.3. Summary number (1) (2) (3) (4) (others)

2.1.6.4. Order of the unit’s appearance on the news show.

2.1.6.5. Block (per ¼ hour): 1st, 2nd, 3rd.

2.2. GENRE IDENTIFICATION

2.2.1. News units

2.2.2. Opinion units

2.2.3. Documentation

2.3. IDENTIFICATION OF THE JOURNALISTIC ACTOR

2.3.1. Presenter

2.3.2. Reporter

- 2.3.3. Correspondent
- 2.3.4. Off-screen presenter
- 2.3.5. Off-screen reporter
- 2.3.6. Off-screen correspondent

2.4. SUMMARY OF THE NEWS UNIT

2.5. IDENTIFICATION OF THE MAIN CHARACTER

[Types of characters]

2.5.1. Individual

- 2.5.1.1. Sex (male/female)
- 2.5.1.2. Age (child/adolescent/young person/
adult/old person)
- 2.5.1.3. National condition (Spanish/Not-Spanish;
if Not-Spanish: European Community /
Extra-European Community/
Africa/Asian/American, etc.)

2.5.2. Group

- 2.5.2.1. Type
 - NGO (non-governmental association)
 - Social (neighbours, religious, students,
etc.)
 - Others
- 2.5.2.2. Name or description

2.5.3. Institutional

- 2.5.3.1. Spanish government
- 2.5.3.2. Autonomous community government
- 2.5.3.3. Local government
- 2.5.3.4. European Union policy
- 2.5.3.5. Foreign policy
- 2.5.3.6. Legislative power
- 2.5.3.7. Spanish parliament
- 2.5.3.8. Autonomous community parliament
- 2.5.3.9. European Parliament
- 2.5.3.10. Judicial power
- 2.5.3.11. Trade union
- 2.5.3.12. Ecclesiastical hierarchy
- 2.5.3.13. Business/financial activity
- 2.5.3.14. University and/or scientific
and technical
- 2.5.3.15. Intellectual and artistic activity
- 2.5.3.16. Journalism and social community
- 2.5.3.17. Crime
- 2.5.3.18. Terrorism

- 2.5.3.19. Sports
- 2.5.3.20. Entertainment
- 2.5.3.21. Others

2.6. IDENTIFICATION OF MAIN TOPIC

[Elaborate type of main topics on the basis of key words, up to a maximum of four]

3. IDENTIFICATION OF SOURCES (OF NEWS STORIES AND IMAGES)

3.1. TYPE OF CONFLICT THAT IS THE OBJECT OF ATTENTION

- 3.1.1. Extent to which it could be anticipated
 - 3.1.1.1. Anticipated event
(continuation or development)
 - 3.1.1.2. Scheduled event
(agenda, press conference, etc.)
 - 3.1.1.3. Non-scheduled event
 - 3.1.1.4. Others
- 3.1.2. Journalistic coverage
 - 3.1.2.1. Coverage with institutional presence
 - 3.1.2.2. Coverage without institutional presence
- 3.1.3. Level of Novelty
 - 3.1.3.1. New conflict
 - 3.1.3.2. Conflict in development
- 3.1.4. Intervention of the TV station
 - 3.1.4.1. Originated by the TV station
 - 3.1.4.2. Not originated by the TV station

3.2. NEWS SOURCE

- 3.2.1. Official source
 - 3.2.1.1.Types:
 - 3.2.1.1.1. Parliament
 - 3.2.1.1.2. Government
 - 3.2.1.1.3. Judicial power
 - 3.2.1.1.4. Police
 - 3.2.1.1.5. Other (specify)
 - 3.2.1.2. Sphere of power:
 - 3.2.1.2.1. Local
 - 3.2.1.2.2. Autonomous community
 - 3.2.1.2.3. State
 - 3.2.1.2.4. European

- 3.2.1.2.5. International
- 3.2.2. Non-Official Source
 - 3.2.2.1. Protagonists of the news story
 - 3.2.2.2. Civil organisation (specify)
 - 3.2.2.3. Family members
 - 3.2.2.4. Neighbours
 - 3.2.2.5. Other media (specify)
 - 3.2.2.6. Others (specify)
- 3.3. MENTION OF THE SOURCE
 - 3.3.1. Explicit reference
 - 3.3.2. Implicit reference
 - 3.3.3. No reference
- 3.4. IMAGES
 - 3.4.1. SOURCE OF THE IMAGES
 - 3.4.1.1. Newsroom
 - 3.4.1.2. Own reporter or correspondent
 - 3.4.1.3. News agency (specify)
 - 3.4.1.4. Another station (specify if known)
 - 3.4.1.5. Police
 - 3.4.1.6. Amateur
 - 3.4.1.7. Archive
 - 3.4.1.8. Not specified
 - 3.4.1.9. Others
 - 3.4.2. LINK BETWEEN IMAGES AND THEME
 - 3.4.2.1. An additional complement
 - 3.4.2.2. Graphic illustration of the issue (maps, graphs, etc.)
 - 3.4.2.3. Constitutes the issue of the unit
 - 3.4.2.4. Biographical information
 - 3.4.2.5. Others
- 3.5. ASSESSMENT OF ACCESS TO SOURCES
 - 3.5.1. Positive assessment
 - 3.5.2. Negative assessment
 - 3.5.3. Neutral assessment
 - 3.5.4. No assessment made

4. ANALYSIS OF WHAT IS SAID

- 4.1. ATTITUDE AND BEHAVIOUR OF THE SPEAKER
 - 4.1.1. Explicit implication of “us exclusively”

- 4.1.2. Implicit implication of “us exclusively”
- 4.1.3. Explicit implication of “us inclusively”
- 4.1.4. Implicit implication of “us inclusively”
- 4.1.5. Neutral behaviour on part of the speaker

4.2. TERRITORY OF THE INFORMATION

- 4.2.1. Neutral information
- 4.2.2. The implicit reference is the State
- 4.2.3. The explicit reference is the State
- 4.2.4. The implicit reference is the autonomous community
- 4.2.5. The explicit reference is the autonomous community
- 4.2.6. The implicit reference is the EU
- 4.2.7. The explicit reference is the EU
- 4.2.8. The implicit reference is abroad
- 4.2.9. The explicit reference is abroad

4.3. MENTION OF THE TERRITORY

- 4.3.1. No reference to geographic location
- 4.3.2. Reference to Spain
- 4.3.3. Reference to the autonomous community
- 4.3.4. Reference to a province
- 4.3.5. Reference to a people (explicit)
- 4.3.6. Reference to a foreign country (specify)
- 4.3.7. Reference to a geopolitical region (specify)
- 4.3.8. Reference to a continent
- 4.3.9. Others

4.4. SPOKEN RELATIONSHIP OF PROXIMITY

- 4.4.1. Use of inclusive expressions
- 4.4.2. Use of exclusive expressions
- 4.4.3. Implicit reference to close relations
- 4.4.4. Implicit reference to distanced relations
- 4.4.5. No reference to proximity

4.5. PRESENCE OF ELEMENTS INDICATING CONTACT

- 4.5.1. In the presentation of the unit
- 4.5.2. In the development of the unit
- 4.5.3. In both cases
- 4.5.4. No presence of indicators of contact

4.6. SPOKEN ASSESSMENT OF THE UNIT (by the speaker)

- 4.6.1. Explicit positive comment

- 4.6.2. Implicit positive comment
- 4.6.3. Explicit negative comment
- 4.6.4. Implicit negative comment
- 4.6.5. Neutral assessment

5. EVALUTION ANALYSIS (‘bias’ factor: positive vs. negative)

- 5.1. Positive: only positive references to a particular political action
- 5.2. Quite positive: there were more positive references than negative ones
- 5.3. Negative: only negative references
- 5.4. Quite negative: there were more negative references than positive ones
- 5.5. Mixed: an equal mixture of positive and negative references
- 5.6. Neutral: no references, either positive or negative

6. EPISODIC DIMENSION / THEMATIC ANALYSIS

- 6.1. Episodic
- 6.2. Mainly episodic
- 6.2. Thematic
- 6.3. Mainly thematic

7. ANALYSIS OF CAUSALITY ATTRIBUTION

- 7.1. Mechanical cause
 - 7.1.1. Intermediary agent (e.g., person being tortured)
 - 7.1.2. Machines
 - 7.1.3. Trained animals
 - 7.1.4. Unconscious individuals
- 7.2. Accidental Cause
 - 7.2.1. Nature
 - 7.2.2. Weather
 - 7.2.3. Earthquakes
 - 7.2.4. Machines out of control
- 7.3. Intentional Cause
 - 7.3.1. Assaults, violence
 - 7.3.2. Oppression

- 7.3.3. Conspiracy
- 7.3.4. Action plan
- 7.4. Inadvertent Cause
 - 7.4.1. Intermediary circumstances
 - 7.4.2. Unanticipated effects
 - 7.4.3. Negligence
 - 7.4.4. Lack of attention
 - 7.4.5. Omission

8. COVERAGE ANALYSIS

- 8.1. Strategic coverage
- 8.2. Quite strategic coverage
- 8.3. Political coverage
- 8.4. Quite political coverage

9. ANALYSIS OF THE MEDIA AS ACTORS

- 9.1. Taking of an explicit position of the unit on the principal topic
 - 9.1.1. In this case, summary of the taking of position (favourable, unfavourable, with qualifications, etc.)
- 9.2. Explicit proposal to solve the problem in question
 - 9.2.1. In this case, summary of the proposal
- 9.3. No position is taken

ANNEX 2 IDENTIFICATION OF THE KEY WORDS

The research team prepared a brief repertoire of key words related with the problems concerning recent immigration in Spain. To prepare the list, the team consulted documents that already existed on the problems of immigration and

used a sufficiently significant sample of the news on this issue in the press. Once prepared, the team carried out diverse tests for checking among analysts to apply it to the television samples properly.

Proposal of key words to analyse immigration on the television news shows in Spain

GROUP 1. SOCIOGEOGRAPHIC SPACE

Spain
Andalusia
Canary Islands
Catalonia
Galicia
Madrid
Basque Country
Valencia
Ceuta/Melilla
Strait of Gibraltar
Local/municipal
Arabic countries
Morocco
Other Maghreb countries
Others
Sub-Saharan Africa
Latin America
Argentina
Colombia
Ecuador
Peru
Mexico
Others
Asian countries
China
Pakistan
Others
Eastern European countries
Albania
Former Yugoslavia
Russia
Others
Other sociogeographic references

GROUP 2. SOCIAL AGENTS

Municipal/local administration
Autonomous community administration
Spanish central administration
Spanish parliament
Autonomous community parliaments
Spanish government
Autonomous community governments
Spanish courts
European Commission
European Parliament
Police/forces of order
Other public authorities
Business organisations
Trade union organisations
NGOs
Catholic church
Other religious institutions
Religious leaders
Intellectuals
Other social leaders
Journalists/communicators
Media
Family members
Immigrants (individuals)
Immigrants (groups)
Immigrants (minors)
Autochthonous individuals
Criminals/groups/mafias

GROUP 3. THEMES/ACTIONS

General social phenomenon	Speeches about immigration
	Racism
	Demographic impact/effect
	Formation of urban immigrant ghettos
	Coexistence
	Multiculturalism
	Studies and statistics
Social opinions and response	Racism
	Speeches about immigration
	Demonstrations-protests
	Demonstrations-acts of solidarity
	Humanitarian actions
	Insults/opinions of rejection
	Assaults and attacks
	Opinion polls
Immigration policies	Legislative bills
	Legalisation/residency permits
	Nationalisation
	Justice
	Repatriations/expulsions
	Beatings
	Other government and administrative actions
Education	School integration
	School enrolments
Cultural practices	Customs and traditions
	Conflict between cultural practices
	Family models
	Religious practices
	Religious conflicts
Work and jobs	Contracting
	Unemployment
	Effects on the economy
	Job position quality
Movements	Accidents and rescues
	Pateras
	Illegal transport networks
	Immigration routes
Housing	Difficulties in obtaining housing
	Living conditions
Public health and health	Economic effects
	Illnesses
	Healthcare